

General GIAC Gold paper scoring rubric

	0-1	2-4	5-7	8-9	10
Content and structure	Paper is without any real content or structure	Paper has minimal or superficial content and/or a poor structure	Paper has adequate content and/or structure	Paper has good content and/or structure	Paper has excellent content and/or structure
Language	Paper has many spelling and/or grammar errors	Paper has some spelling and/or grammar errors	Spelling is clean and adequate use of language	Spelling is clean and good use of language	Spelling is clean and excellent use of language
Referencing	Paper has no references	Paper has minimal and/or faulty references	References are used where necessary	References are used where necessary and refer to original work	Excellent use of high-quality references
Knowledge and Wisdom	Domain knowledge represented by the paper could be found from Internet sources in fifteen minutes or less	Domain knowledge represented by the paper could easily be found using common search engines	Domain knowledge represented by the paper is a fairly complete coverage of the subject and brings the information together in a single paper that reflects the body of searchable knowledge available on the Internet after it is posted.	Domain knowledge could only be found by hours of Internet searching as well as using books, periodicals and other sources, and represents an increase in the body of searchable knowledge available on the Internet after it is posted.	Domain knowledge could only be found by hours of Internet searching, primary research such as interviews and experiments, as well as using books, periodicals and other sources, and represents an increase in the body of searchable knowledge available on the Internet after it is posted.
Community Service	If published, the paper would do the community a disservice.	The paper does not provide benefits to the community	The paper provides some benefits to the community	The paper benefits the community	The paper benefits the community greatly

Supplemental scoring rubric for management GIAC Gold papers

	0-1	2-4	5-7	8-9	10
Actionable items	Paper provides no actionable tips for planning, organizing, staffing, leading or directing, and controlling a group or organization.	Paper provides a few actionable tips for planning, organizing, staffing, leading or directing, and controlling a group or organization.	Paper provides a useful set of actionable tips for planning, organizing, staffing, leading or directing, and controlling a group or organization.	Paper provides a comprehensive set of actionable tips for planning, organizing, staffing, leading or directing, and controlling a group or organization	Paper provides a comprehensive set of actionable tips for planning, organizing, staffing, leading or directing, and controlling a group or organization.
Framework-driven approach (see below)	Paper provides no structured framework.	Paper provides a faint framework that is generic and/or not specific to the subject.	Paper provides a framework that is reasonably aligned with the subject.	Paper provides a framework that is well-aligned with the subject matter.	Paper provides an intuitive and comprehensive framework that maps directly onto the subject matter.

A framework is a tiered approach that shows how individual actions fit together when you raise the level of abstraction. In conceptual modeling, we called that going from a model to a meta-model, or from a meta-model to a meta-meta-model. Consider a scenario where you may review log files, check IDS alerts, speak to users, look at help desk records, review netflows, check SIEMs, etc. All of these actions are separate operations, but when you take a step back and adopt a higher level of abstraction, it becomes clear that they are all part of the *identification* phase. Making such relationships clear and having them logically interact with each other and apply some prescriptive guidelines is what I consider to be a framework.

Supplemental scoring rubric for technical GIAC Gold papers

	0-1	2-4	5-7	8-9	10
Application of technology	Paper provides no guidance on how to apply technology and does not discuss benefit from using the chosen technology	Paper provides some guidance on how to apply technology and somewhat discusses benefits from using the chosen technology	Paper provides guidance on how to apply technology and discusses benefits from using the chosen technology in general terms	Paper provides guidance on how to apply technology and discusses benefits from using the chosen technology in specific terms	Paper provides excellent guidance on how to apply technology and discusses benefits from using the chosen technology in specific measured terms
State-of-the-art	The technology discussed in the paper is outdated	The technology discussed in the paper will soon be outdated	The technology discussed in the paper is current	The technology discussed in the paper is state-of-the-art	The technology discussed in the paper is raising the bar of the state-of-the-art

To use the metric, complete the general rubric, and one of the management rubric/technical rubric. Calculate percentage of maximum achievable score. As a guidance, a score of 70% or higher should be considered a passing score.